

1 Richard K. Bridgford, Esq., SBN: 119554
2 Michael H. Artinian, Esq., SBN: 203443
3 **BRIDGFORD, GLEASON & ARTINIAN**
4 26 Corporate Plaza, Suite 250
5 Newport Beach, CA 92660
6 Telephone: (949) 831-6611; Facsimile: (949) 831-6622

7 Richard L. Kellner, Esq., SBN: 171416
8 **KABATECK LLP**
9 633 West Fifth Street, Suite 3200
10 Los Angeles, CA 90017
11 Telephone: (213) 217-5000; Facsimile: (213) 217-5010

12 John Patrick McNicholas, IV, Esq., SBN: 125868
13 **McNICHOLAS & McNICHOLAS, LLP**
14 10866 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 1400
15 Los Angeles, CA 90024
16 Telephone: (310) 474-1582; Facsimile: (310) 475-7871

17 Attorneys for Plaintiffs KIRAN SHAH and HEMANGINI PATEL
18 and JOSEPH and PATRICIA MICHEL,
19 on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated

20 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
21 **COUNTY OF ORANGE**

22 KIRAN SHAH and HEMANGINI PATEL;
23 ANTHONY GODFREY and NAOMI
24 GODFREY; VICTOR GUDZUNAS and
25 JULIE GUDZUNAS; EYNALD DUARTE
26 and MADELEINE DUARTE, on behalf of
27 themselves and all others similarly situated,

28 Plaintiffs,

vs.

PULTE HOME CORPORATION, a
Corporation; MUELLER INDUSTRIES,
INC., a Corporation, and DOES 1-100,

Defendants.

AND RELATED CROSS-CLAIMS.

CASE NO. 30-2014-00731604-CU-CD-CXC
Assigned for all purposes to:
Judge Peter Wilson
Dept. CX-101

**DECLARATION OF ILYM GROUP'S
PRESIDENT LISA MULLINS IN
SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION
FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF
CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT**

Hearing Date: March 2, 2023
Time: 2:00 p.m.
Dept.: CX-101

Complaint Filed: 06/30/2014

1 DECLARATION OF LISA MULLINS

2
3 I, Lisa Mullins, declare as follows:

4 1. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein and if called upon to testify, I could
5 and would do so competently under oath.

6 2. I am employed by ILYM Group, Inc. (“ILYM”), as President.

7 3. I personally have over 13 years of experience in claims management and administration of
8 class and collective action matters.

9 4. ILYM has extensive experience administering class action matters. ILYM has
10 administered complex wage and hour, labor and employment, consumer/ product liability, TCPA,
11 FLSA, FACTA, ERISA and PAGA class action matters, thru final approval and distribution. ILYM
12 has developed a system of quality assurance measures, to ensure the highest quality service is
13 provided in our cases and to class members.

14 5. ILYM’s Claims Management Group has extensive experiences in all aspects of
15 Notification and Identification of Class Members, Claims Processing, Formulation and Calculation
16 Methodologies, Award Distribution and Taxation, Accounting and Reconciliation.

17 6. ILYM has extensive experience in and are experts at all aspects of complex class action
18 matters including; (i) preparing, printing, mailing and tracking privacy notices; (ii) operation of a Bi-
19 lingual call center; (iii) establishing settlement websites; (iv) claims management; (v) USPS
20 processes and systems, third party tracing, including the use of reverse telephone directory services;
21 (v) database management, programming and security protocols; (vii) calculating and issuing
22 settlement payments; (viii) tax management, filings, and account reconciliation; and (ix) final
23 approval.

24 7. ILYM has been appointed as a Claims Administrator in both State and Federal Courts.

25 8. A true and correct copy of ILYM’s Curriculum Vitae is attached hereto as **Exhibit A**.

26 9. ILYM has been chosen by the parties to administer the proposed settlement in this case.

27 This administration project has a cap of \$29,000.00 for the following services: (a) following
28 preliminary approval, conduct a chain of title search and update the list of names and addresses of all

1 individuals in the chain of title for the class homes covered by the settlement that was prepared by
2 the prior class administrator; (b) mailing the notices for preliminary and final approval to the
3 individuals identified in the chain of title; (c) engaging in “skip tracing” for any returned mailings for
4 inaccurate addresses and mailing same to new address; (d) setting up a website and on-line portal for
5 the administration of the settlement; (e) deploying staff to answer class member questions; (f)
6 interface with class and defense counsel; (g) manage the distribution of settlement proceeds to
7 participating class members; (h) reporting to the Court the results of the administration of this
8 settlement; and (i) providing any further services necessary for the administration of the settlement.

9 10. A detailed breakdown of ILYM’s charges is attached hereto as **Exhibit B**.

10 11. All settlement funds deposited by Defendants will be held in a Qualified Settlement Fund
11 until disbursement.

12 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing
13 is true and correct.

14 Executed on February 1, 2023 at Tustin, California.

15
16 A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Lisa Mullins", is written over a horizontal line.

17 Lisa Mullins
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT “A”

ILYM | GROUP, Inc.

SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATION EXPERTS

Overview of Our Firm:

ILYM Group, Inc is a class action administration, legal notification and direct media outlets firm. With over 20 years of combined experience, our primary commitments are to client satisfaction, cutting edge technology and data management security, seamless case management and delivery of case expectations. Because, of our adherence to these commitments, ILYM Group, Inc is a one of the fastest growing, Woman Owned Business (NAPW), in the industry and is becoming the go-to firm for class action administration and legal notification. ILYM Group, Inc works with the top defense and plaintiff firms across the United States.

AREAS OF EXPERTISE:

- Wage and Hour
- FLSA
- Insurance and Health Care
- Consumer
- Finance
- Employment and Labor
- Securities
- Antitrust
- TCPA

Malta vs. Wells Fargo Home Mortgage Inc.

- TCPA Case with a class size of 5,200,000.

Gerardo Mojica vs. Compass Group USA, Inc.

- Wage & Hour Case with a class size of 22,573

Jacqueline Jones vs. I.Q. Data International, Inc.

- TCPA Case with a class size of 93,993. Performed a reverse look-up to obtain Class Member information. We were able to obtain contact information for 93.82% of the Class that did not have a name or address.

Grinder, et al. v. Clark County Collection Service, LLC.

- TCPA Case with a class size of 15,659. Performed a reverse look-up to obtain Class Member information. We were able to obtain contact information for 97% of the Class that did not have a name or address.

Kimberly Roberts, et al. v. T.J. Maxx of CA, LLC, et al.

- Wage & Hour Case with a class size of 82,549.

Reza Barani vs. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.

- TCPA Case with a class size of 82,874. Performed a reverse look-up to obtain Class Member information. We were able to obtain contact information for 87.84% of the Class that did not have a name or address.

Blaise Picchi et al., vs. World Financial Network Bank, et al.

- TCPA Case with a class size of 856,507. Performed a reverse look-up to obtain Class Member information. We were able to obtain contact information for 93.21% that did not have a valid address associated with the contact record.

ILYM | GROUP, Inc.

SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATION EXPERTS

ILYM Group, Inc. is operational 24/7 delivering true client and class member availability. Our call center is open 24/7/365 days a year, even holidays and is full digital, automated and multilingual. ILYM Group Inc.'s mail and media center is a state-of-the-art facility, fully digital and USPS integrated. We can accommodate cases of any size, from ten class members to multi-millions. ILYM Group, Inc. prides itself on its commitment to service, quality, value pricing and availability. We've committed ourselves to being the best Class Action Administration and Notification Company in our industry. Through our years of experience, ILYM Group, Inc. is dedicated to exceeding our client's expectations.

PRE-SETTLEMENT CONSULTATION

- **Administration Consultation:** Meeting to determine objectives and expectations by both parties. All reporting and responsibilities will be agreed upon as will the seamless process to access data. We will also discuss the opportunities to identify class members with the proposed print and web-based media for optimum reach. Additionally, all expectations and delivery of those results will be planned for and mapped accordingly.

MAILING AND NOTIFICATION

- **Fulfillment and Correspondence:** All provided settlement information will be published via United States Postal Service (USPS first class standards) to the proposed mailing class. Notifications will include a Claim ID and how to respond, or Opt-Out, based on the stipulations.
- **Reverse Lookup:** A confidential reverse phone or reverse cell lookup will provide; owner's name, location, address history, carrier, phone type (landline or cell phone) and more. Our reverse lookup is powered by an extensive database which includes hundreds of millions of cell phone, landline, residential and unlisted number. Our software collects data from multiple data sources and carriers across the US. Our average "hit ratio" ranges from 93% - 98%.
- **Creating Class Database:** All Data is verified and filtered to eliminate duplication against the United States Postal Service (USPS) National Change of Address (NCOA) database. ILYM Group, Inc. will also certify and validate with the Coding Accuracy Support System (CASS) and Track Your Class (TYC) for zone delivery.
- **Claim Forms:** ILYM Group, Inc. will email all claim forms, whenever possible, to have accurate reporting and tracking of all class requests. Emails will contain full text claim forms.
- **Translations:** When needed, ILYM Group, Inc. will translate notices to any language needed to reach Class members.
- **Remails:** Returned mail will be scanned, re-verified and re-mailed. All returned mail is data warehoused and reported to both parties' counsels in a weekly report.

MEDIA & INTERNET BANNER ADS

Notice Publication

- **Legal Notices:** ILYM Group, Inc. can provide a Media Proposal to maximize reach based on quantitative and qualitative methodologies.
- **Electronic Publication (Banner Ads):** ILYM Group, Inc. will utilize Internet Banner Noticing efforts and web technologies for maximum reach via the World Wide Web.

ILYM | GROUP, Inc.

SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATION EXPERTS

- **Electronic Mail Notices:** ILYM Group, Inc. can email an estimated number of class members a full text notice. We are compliant with all search engines and Internet Service Providers (ISP) so that our emails are always “White List” accepted with minimal returns.
- **Reach:** Every case has its own proposed reach and exposure percentage. We filter, verify and scrub the data to improve reach results.
- **Services Included:** Analysis, Documentation, Research and Methodologies, Execution and Reporting.

PROJECT MANAGEMENT

- **Case Notification, Maintenance and Management:** ILYM Group, Inc.’s Senior Project Managers will provide all Account Management, Pre-Consultation to Case Conclusion, Reporting and Claims Processing. Design, negotiation and implementation, upon approval, of all forms and notices, all distribution reporting and filings with the court.
- **Claims Processing:** All claims can be submitted by USPS, Internet, Fax, and Email or Online submission. Claims will be processed and recorded with matching ILYM database ID's. E-claims will have corresponding records of intake. All deficient claims will be notified via USPS and make provisions for class member to re-submit claims.
- **Call Center:** ILYM Group, Inc. will support class members with a toll-free number to get the most up-to-date case settlement information. Customer service representatives will be available 24/7/365 as will recorded messages.
All class members are given the options to best serve their needs and to receive case information.
- **Internet Support:** Class members can log on to a provided website and view, print or submit information and claim forms regarding the settlement. Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ’s) will be provided as well. Class members may download the claim form with mailing and fax instructions provided on the form.
- **Objection and Request for Exclusion:** All objections and request for exclusion, opt-out, will be data warehoused, dated and reported. Postmarks will serve for exclusion dating and will be forwarded to both counsels’ no more than 5 days post submission. Objection will be reviewed by ILYM Group, Inc. to determine the timeliness and basis of the objection. All information will be forwarded to both parties counsel, along with any representation information from the class member, within 5 days.

DATA ADMINISTRATION AND NETWORK SECURITY

- **Network Security:** All provided data is encrypted, stored and hosted in a Tier 4, SAS70 certified environment.
- **Database Administration:** To be developed with all electronically provided data. Class members will be assigned ILYM Group, Inc. internal tracking ID’s to ensure all collected member data coincides with all received claims.

DISTRIBUTION AND SETTLEMENT FUNDING

- ***Distribution and Management:*** Upon receipt of settlement funds, ILYM Group, Inc. will open a QSF Account for proceeds of the Gross Settlement Payment. The deposited funds will then be managed per the Settlement Agreement. All funds will be settled with class members and counsel along with all federal and state income tax reporting.
- ***Check Printing and Mailing:*** Claims processed, quantified and approved by clients, will be processed for distribution. All checks will be printed and mailed via USPS first class standards. ILYM Group, Inc. will reissue checks in accordance with the Settlement Agreement.
- ***Preparation, Filing and Reporting of Taxes:*** ILYM Group, Inc. will ensure taxes are filed in accordance to all federal, state and local employment tax returns. All taxes associated with the settlement will be paid on time to tax authorities. All filings and returns (e.g., 1099s, W-2s, etc.) will be done properly and timely with the appropriate authorities. All QSF steps and obligations with federal, state and/or local law will be followed.

CASE CONCLUSION

- ***Data Manager Final Report:*** All database and electronic documentation will be sent in reports weekly and at the conclusion of the Administration engagement. Call center activity, e-claims, mailed, and faxed claims will be included in all reporting.
- ***Project Manager Final Report:*** All case and class related information will be provided on a weekly basis and at the conclusion of the Administration engagement. Mailing and media final analysis, exclusions, objections, and all other claims processing outcomes, status reports and final court documentations will be included.
- ***Affidavits:*** ILYM Group, Inc. will provide all affidavits in support of analysis and media reach, final approvals and settlement. Expert Testimony and Media Methodologies will be determined.
- ***Document Retention:*** Unless otherwise directed, ILYM Group, Inc. will destroy all undeliverable notices on the effective date of the settlement or when the case is no longer subject to appeal. ILYM Group, Inc. will correspond for one year after the final distribution or until the case is no longer subject to appeal.

EXHIBIT “B”

ILYM | GROUP, Inc.

SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATION EXPERTS

Case Name: Shah v. Pulte

Wednesday, November 2, 2022

Requesting Attorney:

E-Mail

ILYM Contact

E-Mail

Contact Number

Mike Artinian

mike.artinian@bridgfordlaw.com

Lisa Mullins

Lisa@ilymgroup.com

714.878.8836

ESTIMATE FOR ADMINISTRATION SOLUTIONS

ASSUMPTIONS

Total Estimated Homes in Ladera Ranch	151
Estimated Percentage of Undeliverable Mail	20%
NCOA	Yes
Obtain Chain of Title Owners	Yes

Activity	Rate Type	Unit Cost	Volume	Amount
----------	-----------	-----------	--------	--------

CASE STARTUP

Initial Setup - Import and Formatting of Data*	Hourly	\$150.00	2	\$300.00
Programming of Class Database	Hourly	\$175.00	2	\$350.00
Obtain Chain of Title Owners	Per Piece	\$100.00	151	\$15,100.00

*ILYM assumes that data will be in a standard format. Client will be notified immediately if not in standard format to correct data or ILYM can convert to standard format @ \$150.00 per hour.

Subtotal \$15,750.00

PROJECT MANAGEMENT

Project Manager (Case notification and maintenance)	Hourly	\$120.00	3	\$360.00
Staff Hours for Processing Claims	Hourly	\$70.00	2	\$140.00
Staff Hours for Processing Returned Mail	Hourly	\$70.00	2	\$140.00
Report Processing	Hourly	\$70.00	2	\$140.00
Skip Trace Previous Owners	Per Piece	\$2.50	453	\$1,132.50
NCOA	Per Piece	\$250.00	1	\$250.00
Validating Claims of Repair	Flat Fee	\$2,500.00	1	\$2,500.00
Toll-Free Customer Support	Flat Fee	\$300.00	1	\$300.00
Static Website	Flat Fee	\$1,200.00	1	\$1,200.00
Weekly Reports	Flat Fee	\$250.00	1	\$250.00

Subtotal \$6,412.50

ILYM | GROUP, Inc.

SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATION EXPERTS

Activity	Rate Type	Unit Cost	Volume	Amount
NOTIFICATION/MAILING				
Fulfillment of Notice	Per Piece	\$1.50	453	\$679.50
USPS First Class Postage	Per Piece	\$0.57	453	\$258.21
Remails (Forward/Skip Trace Undeliverables)	Per Piece	\$2.00	91	\$181.20
Storage, Photocopies, Deliveries	Flat Fee	\$350.00	1	\$350.00

Subtotal **\$1,468.91**

DISTRIBUTION (Includes EIN, Bank Acct * /QSF Setup)				
Distribution Setup & Management	Hourly	\$150.00	2	\$300.00
Account Reconciliation & Distribution Reporting	Hourly	\$125.00	2	\$250.00
Check, Stub & Release - Print & Mail (All Applicable Tax Forms)	Per Check	\$1.25	138	\$172.50
Check Mailing Postage	Per Piece	\$0.57	138	\$78.66
Remails (Forward/Skip Trace Undeliverables)	Per Piece	\$2.00	28	\$55.20
Sending Checks to Non-Repaired Homes	Per Piece	\$2.50	138	\$345.00
Preparation of Taxes	Hourly	\$120.00	3	\$360.00
Annual Filing of Tax Return	Per Year	\$1,500.00	1	\$1,500.00

***Additional Bank fees may apply*

Subtotal **\$3,061.36**

CASE CONCLUSION				
Data Manager Final Reporting	Hourly	\$100.00	1	\$100.00
Project Manager Final Reporting	Hourly	\$120.00	1	\$120.00

Subtotal **\$220.00**

Total Case Estimate: **\$26,912.77**

CASE TOTAL WILL NOT EXCEED: **\$29,000.00**

Terms and Conditions

All services to be provided by ILYM Group, Inc. (hereinafter, "ILYM") to Client shall be subject to the following terms and conditions:

Services: Subject to the terms hereof, ILYM agrees to provide the Client with Administration Services (hereinafter, "services") as specified in the Proposal provided to Client to which these Terms and Conditions are attached. The estimate is in good faith and does not cover any applicable taxes and fees. The estimate does not make provision for any services or class members/size not delineated in the request for proposal or stipulations. Such services do not in any way constitute legal services or advice. ILYM is performing its services as an Independent Contractor and neither it nor its employees shall be deemed to be employees of the Client.

Mailing and Data Conversion: ILYM's database administration assumes the Client will provide complete data that includes all information required to send notifications and complete the administration process. Data must be provided in a complete, consistent, standardized electronic format. ILYM's standard format is Microsoft Excel, however, ILYM may accept other formats at its discretion. Further developments or enhancements to non-standardized data will be billed to Client by ILYM on a time and materials basis, according to ILYM's Standard Rates.

Charges for Services: Charges to the Client for services shall be on a time and materials basis at our prevailing rates, as the same may change from time to time. Any fee estimates set forth in the proposal are estimates only, based on information provided by Client to ILYM. Actual fees charged by ILYM to Client may be greater or less than such estimate, and Client shall be responsible for the payment of all such charges and expenses in accordance with Section 5 hereof. Charges incurred related to resolving post distribution withholdings and related corrective files due to voids and re-issues of payments and related correspondence with state and federal taxing authorities will not be charged to the Client to the extent that funds are received from the taxing authorities offset these charges. ILYM may derive financial benefits from financial institutions in connection with the deposit and investment of settlement funds with such institutions, including without limitation, discounts on eligible banking services and fees, and loans at favorable rates.

Indemnification: Client will indemnify and hold ILYM (and the officers, employees, affiliates and agents harmless against any Losses incurred by ILYM, arising out of, in connection with, or related to (i) any breach of the terms by Client; (ii) the processing and handling of any payment by ILYM in accordance with Client's instructions, including without limitation, the imposition of any stop payment or void payment on any check or the wrongful dishonor of a check by ILYM pursuant to Client's instructions.

Payment of Charges: ILYM reserves the right to request payment of postage charges and 50% of the final administration charges at the start of the case. ILYM bills are due upon receipt unless otherwise negotiated and agreed to with the Client. In the event settlement terms provide that ILYM is to be paid out of the Settlement Fund, ILYM will request that Counsel endeavor to make alternate payment arrangements for ILYM charges that are due at the onset of the case. The entire remaining balance is due and payable at the time the Settlement Account is funded by, or no later than the time of disbursement. Decisions of the court and actions of the parties, including disapproval or withdrawal of a settlement, do not affect the Client's liability to ILYM for payment of services. Services are not provided on a contingency fee basis.

Confidentiality: ILYM maintains reasonable and appropriate security measures and safeguards to protect the security and confidentiality of Client data provided to ILYM by Client in connection herewith. Should ILYM ever be notified of any judicial order or other proceedings in which a third party seeks to obtain access to the confidential data created by or for the Client, ILYM will promptly notify the Client, unless prohibited by applicable law. The Client shall have the option to (1) provide legal representation at the Client's expense to avoid such access or (2) promptly reimburse ILYM for any of its costs, including attorneys' fees, reasonably incurred in avoiding, attempting to avoid or providing such access and not paid by the entity seeking the data. If ILYM is required, pursuant to a court order, to produce documents, disclose data, or otherwise act in contravention of the obligations imposed by this Agreement, or otherwise, with respect to maintaining the confidentiality, proprietary nature and secrecy of the produced documents or disclosed data, ILYM will not be liable for breach of said obligation.

Data Rights: ILYM does not convey nor does the Client obtain any right in the programs, system data, or materials utilized or provided by ILYM in the ordinary course of business in the performance of this Agreement.

Document Retention: Unless directed otherwise in writing by Client, ILYM will destroy undeliverable mail on the effective date of the settlement or the date that the disposition of the case is no longer subject to appeal or review, whichever is later. ILYM will maintain claim forms and other correspondence for one year after final distribution of funds or benefits, or until the date that the disposition of the case is no longer subject to appeal or review, whichever is later.

Limitation of damages: ILYM is not responsible to the Client for any special, consequential or incidental damages incurred by Client. Any liability of ILYM to the Client shall not exceed the total amount billed to the Client for the particular services that give rise to any loss.

Termination: The services to be provided under this Agreement may be terminated, at will by the Client upon at least 30 calendar days' prior written notice to ILYM. The Client's obligation to pay for services or projects in progress at the time of notice of withdrawal shall continue throughout that 30 day period. ILYM may terminate this Agreement (i) with 10 calendar days' prior written notice, if the Client is not current in payment of charges or (ii) in any event, upon at least 3 months' prior written notice to the Client.

Notice: Any notice required or permitted hereunder shall be in writing and shall be delivered personally, or sent by registered mail, postage prepaid, or overnight courier service to the responsible officer or principal of ILYM or the Client, as applicable, and shall be deemed given when so delivered personally, or, if mailed, five days after the date of deposit in United States mail, or, if sent by courier, one business day after delivery to such courier service.

Force Majeure: To the extent performance by ILYM of any of its obligations hereunder is substantially prevented by reason of any act of God or by reason of any other matter beyond ILYM's reasonable control, then such performance shall be excused and this Agreement, at ILYM's option, be deemed suspended during the continuation of such condition and for a reasonable time thereafter.

Waiver of Rights: No failure or delay on the part of a party in exercising any right hereunder will operate as a waiver of, or impair, any such right. No single or partial exercise of any such right will preclude any other or further exercise thereof or the exercise of any other right. No waiver of any such right will be effective unless given in a signed writing.

Jurisdiction: The parties hereto submit to the jurisdiction of the Court of the applicable case for purposes of any suit, action or proceeding to enforce any provision of, or based on any right arising out of, this Agreement. The parties hereto hereby waive any objection to the laying of venue of any such suit, action or proceeding in the Court.

Entire Agreement: These terms and conditions and the proposal embody the entire agreement between the parties with respect to the subject matter hereof, and cancels and supersedes all prior negotiations, representations, and agreements related thereto, either written or oral, except to the extent they are expressly incorporated herein. No changes in, additions to, or waivers of, the terms and conditions set forth herein will be binding upon any party, unless approved in writing by such party's authorized representative.

PROOF OF SERVICE
Shah v. Pulte Homes, et al.

Orange County Superior Court Case No.: 30-2014-00731604

I, the undersigned, declare that:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am employed in the County where the Proof of Service was prepared and my business address is Law Offices of BRIDGFORD, GLEASON & ARTINIAN, 26 Corporate Plaza, Suite 250, Newport Beach, CA 92660.

On the date set forth below, I served the following document(s): **DECLARATION OF ILYM GROUP'S PRESIDENT LISA MULLINS IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT** on the interested party(s):

SEE ATTACHED SERVICE LIST

by the following means:

- () **BY MAIL:** By placing a true copy thereof, enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid. I am readily familiar with the business practice for collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. On the same day that correspondence is processed for collection and mailing it is deposited in the ordinary course of business with the United States Postal Service in Newport Beach, California to the address(es) shown herein.
- () **BY PERSONAL SERVICE:** By placing a true copy thereof, enclosed in a sealed envelope, I caused such envelope to be delivered by hand to the recipients herein shown (as set forth on the service list).
- () **BY OVERNIGHT DELIVERY:** I served the foregoing document by Overnight Delivery as follows: I placed true copies of the foregoing document in sealed envelopes or packages designated by the express service carrier, addressed to recipients shown herein (as set forth on the service list), with fees for overnight delivery paid or provided for.
- (X) **BY ELECTRONIC MAIL (EMAIL):** I caused a true copy thereof sent via email to the address(s) shown herein.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: February 3, 2023

/s/Debbie Knipe

Debbie Knipe

SERVICE LIST

Shah v. Pulte Homes, et al.

Orange County Superior Court Case No.: 30-2014-00731604

Joseph A. Ferrentino, Esq. Jeffrey R. Brower, Esq. NEWMEYER & DILLION LLP 895 Dove Street, 2 nd Floor Newport Beach, CA 92660	Counsel for Defendant/Cross-Complainant PULTE HOME CORPORATION Telephone: (949) 854-7000 Facsimile: (949) 854-7009 joseph.ferrentino@ndlf.com jeffrey.brower@ndlf.com sue.peterson@ndlf.com Jennifer.sebring@ndlf.com
Anna S. McLean, Esq. SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & HAMPTON LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, 17 th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111-4109	Co-Counsel for Defendants/Cross-Complainant PULTE HOME CORP. Telephone: (415) 434-9100 Facsimile: (415) 434-3947 amclean@sheppardmullin.com
Tracey A. Kennedy, Esq. SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & HAMPTON LLP 333 S. Hope Street, 43 rd Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071-1422	Co-Counsel for Defendant/Cross-Complainant PULTE HOME CORP. Telephone: (213) 620-1780 Facsimile: (213) 620-1398 tkennedy@sheppardmullin.com
Adrienne D. Cohen, Esq. Temre L. Fischer, Esq. LAW OFFICES OF ADRIENNE D. COHEN 18300 Von Karman Ave., Suite 410 Irvine, CA 92612	Counsel for Intervenor ACE AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY for RCR PLUMBING & MECHANICAL, INC. Telephone: (714) 954-0790 Fax: (714) 954-0791 adc@adcohen.com ckw@adcohen.com tlf@adcohen.com
Brian S. Kabateck, Esq. Richard L. Kellner, Esq. KABATECK LLP 633 West Fifth Street, Suite 3200 Los Angeles, CA 90017	Co-Counsel for Plaintiffs Telephone: (213) 217-5000 Facsimile: (213) 217-5010 bsk@kbklawyers.com rlk@kellnerlaw.com
John Patrick McNicholas, IV, Esq. McNICHOLAS & McNICHOLAS, LLP 10866 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 1400 Los Angeles, CA 90024	Co-Counsel for Plaintiffs Telephone: (310) 474-1582 Facsimile: (310) 475-7871 pmc@mcnicholaslaw.com

1 Rick L. Shackelford, Esq.
2 Adam Siegler, Esq.
3 Kevin Cole, Esq.
4 GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP
5 1840 Century Park East, Suite 1900
6 Los Angeles, CA 90067-2121

Counsel for Cross-Defendant
NACOBRE USA LLC
Telephone: (310) 586-7700
Fax: (310) 586-7800
shackelfordr@gtlaw.com
sieglera@gtlaw.com
coleke@gtlaw.com

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28